Staff Variance Report For May 7, 2014 Commission Meeting

- "A" category = staff recommendation is for approval with no equal alternatives because of noncompliance is not adverse.
- "B" category = staff recommendation is for approval with equal alternatives as stated by the proponent.
- "C" category = reserved, meaning staff believes Commission needs to discuss entirety.
- "D" category = recommendation is for denial.
- "I" category = incomplete (with permission of the Chairman).
- "NVR" category = no variance required.

NOTE: All staff recommendations presume code statements on the variances by the applicant are correct, unless otherwise noted. This means that all code statements become conditions of the variances and, if not true, the variances would be subject to Commission sanction. All LBO and LFO responses that they have received a copy of the application for variance are in order, unless otherwise noted.

Tabled Variances:

14-04-2	\mathbf{C}	Applied Behavior Center for Autism – Indianapolis	
		The code requires exiting from a building without the use of a key, special	
		knowledge or effort. This room is a time out room for children with autism. This facility is B occupancy and not an E. No alternatives listed. Is the magnetic lock tied into the fire alarm system? Will this door have the paddle system that must be held in place by personal? Tabled by Commission - no proponent.	
14-04-10	W	First Industrial Properties Withdrawn	
14-04-19(d)		500 Wabash – Terre Haute	
, ,	С	(d) The code permitted height of veneer will be exceeded by 2'6". Foundation will be noncombustible. Four story Type V-A apartment structure, over a 1 floor type I-A. The variance states there is a letter from a design professional attached, but no letter received. The exterior façade changes direction in several locations horizontally, thus making compliance more difficult and costly. What is the cost to comply with requirements? Tabled at request of proponent.	e it
14-04-32	С	Oakbrook Valley – Russiaville Five cabins 28' x 20' with a 20' x 8' covered porch will not be sprinkled per the Indiana Building Code for a Group R occupancy. Proponent proposes to add fire alarms, pull stations, an interior strobe light connected to control panel, with an exterior horn and strobe along with smoke detectors in each cabin. Excessive cost due to need to drill a new well, add storage tank and fire pump. What is the cost of a 13D system? Tabled by Commission - no proponent.	e st

CI **Riley School Conversion Riley Center - Muncie** 14-04-49

Requesting to use a non rated wall for separation of a boundary wall, Chapter 34 evaluation. A two hour 8" masonry wall will be used for a separation boundary wall. Area change of use from an A-3 to an A-2. Smoke detectors and fire alarm throughout the space. Tabled by Commission - incomplete.

New Variances:

14-05-1 B Sanctuary @ Trinity Tower - South Bend

Code required suspension means will not be installed on machine room less elevator. Steel coated belts will be installed in lieu of traditional suspension means. Elevator is complaint with the 2010 edition of A17.1, which has not been adopted in Indiana. Similar variances have been granted before.

The Depot @ Nickel Plate Elevators # 1 & 2 – Fishers 14-05-2(a)(b)

BI (a) Code required suspension means will not be installed on machine room less elevator. 8mm ropes will be installed in lieu of 9.5mm. Elevator is complaint with the 2010 edition of A17.1, which has not been adopted in Indiana. Similar variances have been granted before.

BI(b) The code required governor rope will not be installed on a machine room less elevator. The technology uses a 6.3 mm diameter governor rope in lieu of 9.5mm, which is permitted in the 2010 edition of A17.1, which has not been adopted in Indiana. Elevator is only designed for use with this governor rope. Similar variances have been granted before.

14-05-3 \mathbf{C} Morning Star School - Goshen

The code required sprinkler systems will not be installed in school addition. The proponent states that the occupant load of school is less than 50 this is an addition to and existing building. Lighted exit signs, interconnected smoke detection and alarm system will be installed, along with providing hand held fire extinguishers. This is in a rural location with no readily available water source. Excessive cost to install an oversized well and storage tanks for sprinkler system. What is the cost to install a sprinkler system? How many exits are provided?

River Ridge Retail Center – Jeffersonville 14-05-4

Project#368644 Section 3.19.4.1 requires a manually operated shutoff valve, Section 3.19.4.4 \mathbf{C} requires a manual lowering valve, and Section 3.19.4.5 requires a pressure fitting gauge. A code compliant manual shut off valve, manual lowering valve and pressure gauge fitting will not be provided for a machine room less hydraulic elevator. Electronic monitoring is accomplished via an electronic pressure monitoring arrangement, via an electronic pressure transducer. Remote LCD display located on the 2nd floor service panel. Manual lowering valve is replaced with electronically assisted constant pressure key switch which is located on the 2nd landing within the door jamb of the

elevator and takes a key to access the panel to use the constant pressure switch key. Pressure gage fitting will be replaced with an electronic pressure monitoring arrangement is being provided with a LCD read out. Monitoring will be located on the second floor. This is not within view of the machinery as required by code. How will manual lowering be accomplished in a power failure situation if someone is trapped in the elevator?

C (b) Section 3.26.8 requires a code compliant pressure switch, and a code compliant pressure switch will not be provided. Design is provided with electronic pressure monitoring transducer (on the jack side of the check valve) with remote LCD display located at the 2nd landing within the door jamb of the elevator. When pressure drops below 45 psi, the pressure transducer signal is processed to stop the operation of lowering solenoid. If system pressure is restored to above 60 psi, the system will resume normal operation. This is not within view of the machinery. How does the system meet the requirements for heating and cooling required by the code if the equipment is located in the hoist way? What is the cost difference to install conventional equipment? What are the fire hazards of putting an oil tank in a pit with a shaft and not accessible to fire personal?

14-04-5 C South Bend Heritage Foundation Chapin St. Building – South Bend Project #369381

Change of use of a second floor from B occupancy to an R-2 occupancy will not meet the required two hour horizontal assembly. Proponent is requesting that the R-2 be considered as a standalone compartment so that Chapter 34 analysis can be used for the 2nd floor only. Proponent will comply with all of Chapter 34 provisions. NFPA 13R sprinkler system will be installed in R-2 area. Excessive cost to take out ceiling in lower area and re-install. What is this cost? Why can't sprinkler heads be installed along the ceiling of the first floor?

14-05-6 C Meridian Hills Country Club – Indianapolis

Seasonal tents will be used longer than 30 days allowed by code.

Tent will be used from April through September each year for club events, banquets, luncheons, dinners and golf events. Tents will be erected by Montgomery Tent and Awning, with brick columns and sandbag ballast. Setting tent up and down would be an excessive cost, along with disrupting ongoing activities. Will these tents otherwise comply with the 2008 Indiana Fire Code?

14-05-7 B Streamside Wood Shop – Shipshewana

The code required sprinkler system will not be installed. Proposed wood working facility will make use of an NFPA 664 dust collection system in lieu of sprinkler system. This is in a location with no readily available water source. Excessive cost to install sprinkler system with approximate cost to install well and storage tank at \$125,000. Similar variances have been granted before.

14-05-8 A Dow Agro Sciences Show Farm Canopies – Kirklin

Seasonal canopies will be in place longer than 30 days allowed by code. Three canopies 40'x80', 30'x30' and 20'x20', will be used for visiting public and employees. Each canopy has no walls and will be used from 6/2/14 to 8/31/16. They will be inspected by Boone County local building official after set up.

14-05-9 A Dana Warehouse – Andrews

Required sprinkler system will be disconnected from water supply. This property is being used to store burial vaults. No employees work on a regular basis in this facility, they are there for loading and unloading only. Maintaining heat to the building is an excessive cost. There are numerous fire hydrants surrounding this building.

14-05-10 B Amish Parochial School – Marysville

The code required service sink, lavatories and drinking fountain will not be provided. Water closet and lavatories are provided per State Board of Health approved Sanitary Vault Privies, hand sanitizer dispensers and bottled water will be provided. This is a small Amish school 50' x 44', one story with basement, with no domestic water service. Installation of well, pump system and septic is an excessive cost.

14-05-11 B Martin Dale School – Hagerstown

Same as 14-05-10.

14-05-12 B Shady Maple School – Greensfork

Same as 14-05-10.

14-05-13 B Sunny Meadow School – Fountain City

Same as 14-05-10.

14-05-14 D Fifth Third Bank Security Entrance Vestibule (U.S. 31) – Indianapolis Project #367651

The code requires exiting from a building without the use of a key, special knowledge or effort and does not allow passage through more than one door equipped with a delayed egress lock before entering an exit. Full functioning fire alarm system will be installed to immediately release magnetic locks upon activation of system. Variance states detailed operational procedures will be offered to indicate code compliance, none received with variance. This is a critical public safety element and is a barrier to necessary and immediate exiting.

14-05-15 D Fifth Third Bank Security Entrance Vestibule (W. Washington) – Indianapolis Project #367654

Same as 14-05-15

14-05-16 \mathbf{C} Oasis Diner - Plainfield The code required sprinkler system will not be installed. The sprinkler system is required due to an addition of 544 sq. ft. and an existing occupant load of 128. Fire alarm system with full detection will be provided. The proponent states that there is no feasible method of providing sprinkler protection within the historic modular portion of the building. 14-05-17 CI Indiana State University Mills Hall Renovation - Terre Haute Project #370006 Door locking devices that do not comply with the code will be installed on the stairway doors of a 12 story residential building. The code limits the permitted locking devices to a maximum of 4 stories. Doors will unlock upon activation of the fire alarm system, sprinkler system or upon loss of power. Door device arrangement is needed to enhance personal safety of the student residents. 14-05-18 В Evansville Hyundai Addition – Evansville 9,450 sq. ft. auto repair shop addition will not comply with the Energy Code. Building will have large overhead doors that will be opened and closed various times throughout the day having a negligible benefit on energy savings. The additional cost to install EIFS insulation on the exterior walls is not offset by the energy savings. A similar variance, 12-09-20, was granted. 14-05-19 Α Fishers Fire Station #92 – Fishers Fire station will not be built to meet the Indiana Building Code, accessibility provisions. General public will not be using this area of the facility. There will be an accessible facility provided in general public area. Excessive cost to provide accessibility in a facility that will not require usage by non impaired individuals. 14-05-20 W Heartland Generator Reserve Fuel Tank – Jeffersonville Withdrawn. 14-05-21 Α Subaru Engine Plant Expansion – Lafayette 69,177 sq. ft. engine plant addition will not comply with the Energy Code. Proposed design will install R-11 in lieu of R-19 for the roof assembly. Additional cost to meet energy code is \$45,000. A similar variance, 12-11-28, was granted for a 52,500 sq. ft. addition to this facility. 14-05-22 \mathbf{C} Piada Italian Street Food – Indianapolis Project # 370048 The code required sprinkler system will not be installed. One story building will be 2,965 sq. ft. with seating area for 73 occupants; queue line is calculated at 5 sq. ft per person putting the occupant load at 131. Dining area will be provided with two exits, with maximum travel distance of 50 ft. Cost to install sprinkler system

is approximately \$50,000. Is all of the seating fixed?

14-05-23 Mishawaka Grove Development – Mishawaka

- C (a) Code required number of exits will not be available in a 4 story building. Request is to revise variance # 13-11-69. The previous design was 3 story residential Type V-A building on top of 1 story Type I-A podium. Current request is to eliminate podium structure and to permit 4-story Type V-A "Pod B, North Bank". What is the maximum travel distance to the exit from each unit?
- C (b) Code required NFPA 13 system will not be installed in the R-2 portion of the building. "South Bank" is a 4 story Type V-A construction, R- 2 occupancy, on top of a Type I-A podium which will include an open parking garage that will not be sprinklered. Commercial areas will be sprinklered with a NFPA 13 system. Request is to use a NFPA 13R system in the residential section of the "South Bank". The hardship is the cost to provide an NFPA 13 system within the attic and open-web floor joist cavities. What is the total cost of the project? What is the cost to do the attic and open-web floor joist cavities?
- 14-05-24 BI Lake Prairie Elementary School Classroom Addition Lowell Addition to existing school will cause school to exceed allowable area.

 Addition of 5,100 sq. ft. will be added to an existing school of 70,000 sq. ft.

 The addition will be separated by a 2 hour fire barrier. Exit travel distance will be approximately 100 feet.

14-05-25 CI ITT Indianapolis – Indianapolis

New additional use of an existing building with B and A-3 occupancies by adding an E occupancy will show deficiency in minimum points for the Chapter 34 analysis. Building will be occupied by junior and senior high school students along with college students. Sprinkler system, fire alarm, horns and strobes in corridors are provided. Construction is Type II-B construction. Excessive cost to conduct additional Section 3410 analysis resulting in additional system requirements. In which category are the points missing? What is the cost to do analysis?

- 14-05-26 C China House Restaurant Paoli Project #368866

 Code required fire wall will not be installed between existing buildings.

 Proponent cannot complete total separation between walls, due to not being able to access the back side of the common wall. The request is to allow fire wall be built between the third bay and its steel column supports only on the remodeled side of the restaurant. Are the alternatives sufficient to offset the hazards?
- 14-05-27 C Shellbourne Conference Center Addition Valparaiso

 The code required sprinkler system will not be installed in an R-1 occupancy addition. In lieu of sprinklers, an existing wall will be utilized as a two hour fire wall. Main floor area is 5,800 sq. ft. and the second floor is 1,980 sq. ft.

 Maximum egress route is 97'9". Various ceiling heights will cause sprinkler

system to be below 7' in some areas. How will the existing wall be structurally independent?

- 14-05-28 C Cambridge City Christian Church Cambridge City Project #367510

 The code required sprinkler system will not be installed in a 3500 sq. ft
 gymnasium. Gymnasium will be used for basketball play and church dinners.

 The project would be increased by more than \$60,000. Is there a kitchen as part of the gym? Is clothing stored in the gym all the times? What is the cost of the total project?
- 14-05-29 C **Kaufman Financial Group Indianapolis**Locking device installed on tenant door is not permitted by code. Proponent's request is to install a mag lock. Entrance door will be equipped with an access control, to include sensors on the egress side to detect the occupant approaching. Doors will be on battery back up in the event of a power failure, and they will be connected to the fire panel to unlock the doors in the event of a fire alarm or sprinkler activation. Sensor activation to be installed on door for new tenant. Are the alternatives sufficient to offset the hazards?
- 14-05-30 C Geico Indiana Carmel

 Code required means of egress per calculated occupant load will not be met.

 Tenant will self-limit occupant load to a maximum of 1,300, 265 less than provided for via the existing fire stairs, by using the non-simultaneous use concept. Building is fully sprinklered. Are the alternatives sufficient to offset the hazards?
- 14-05-31 D The Packard Indianapolis

 The code prohibits the use of open flame grills on combustible patios and balconies and within 10 feet of combustible construction. The building exterior is Hardie Plank Siding and brick with metal railings, patios are concrete. These are individual condos. Building is sprinklered throughout but patios and balconies are not sprinklered. What is the cost to comply?
- 14-05-32 A Land O'Lakes Foundation Education Center at Fair Oaks Farm Fair Oaks

 Code required occupant load will be exceeded, using an occupant load of 30 net
 per occupant per sq. ft. Proposed Indiana Building Code will allow 30 sq. ft.
 occupant load for exhibit gallery spaces. The building will be sprinklered
 throughout. Using a more concentrated assembly will result in requirement of an
 emergency voice/alarm communication system.
- 14-05-33 A **Props CPA Office Carmel**Code required common path of egress travel will be exceeded by 6'.

 Hall and reception area will be provided with 120 VAC multiple station smoke detectors.

14-05-34 ΑI Town of Plainfield South Wastewater Treatment Plant Phase II - MGD Expansion – Plainfield

Code required sprinkler system for Group H occupancies will not be installed. Wastewater treatment facility that stores sodium aluminates, a corrosive liquid, in a 1,254 sq. ft. building, that is not normally occupied. Secondary containment will be provided for the tanks.

144-05-35 \mathbf{C} **Buckskin Smith Creek – Elberfeld**

Project #370631 The code required sprinkler system will not be installed in a Type V-B, 1 story 20,000 sq. ft. building. The building is used to store wood fiber. Building is

located 119' from the nearest property line and 300' away from the other buildings on the property. Estimated cost for sprinkler system and pump is

\$198,000. What is the total cost of the project?

14-05-36 Central Noble High School Additions and Renovations – Albion

(a)(b)(c)(d)A (a) Code required 4 hour structurally independent fire wall will not be constructed between existing building and the new addition for the auxiliary gym. Existing school and addition are Type II-B construction. New addition will be protected by an NFPA 13 system.

- \mathbf{C} (b) Code permitted exit travel distance within four areas of the school will be exceeded by 33'. New addition involves enclosing an existing exit court, which will lead to a sprinklered area of the building. A portion of the increased travel distance will be from a sprinklered basement area. Existing corridors have a smoke detection system that will be extended into the new corridors. What occupant load is served by each of the 4 areas? Areas are not indicated on plans.
- (c) Non rated corridors, doors and closures will be constructed in the new В addition and renovated areas in a type E occupancy. New addition and the area being renovated will be protected by an NFPA 13 system. New addition will have a two hour fire barrier.
- (d) Exit discharge area will not exit to a public way. Existing exit corridor will be D enclosed, creating a corridor to the new addition for exiting. The egress court will be provided with exit signs, egress lighting and exit hardware as required for a corridor space. Why can't the exiting comply?

14-05-37 ΑI Reactor Tank Addition - Lafayette

Code required 4 hour structurally independent fire wall will not be constructed between existing building and the new addition of 1,400 sq. ft. Addition will be Type II-B construction, which will be part of a 330,000 sq. ft. facility. Addition will be protected with a NFPA13 system.

14-05-38 **Delta Tau Delta Fraternity Addition – Indianapolis**

(a)(b)ΑI (a) Code required fire separation from corridors to lounge areas will not be met. Building addition is Type III-B construction, with an A- 2 occupancy in basement and R-2 occupancy on other 3 floors of building. The building is approximately 2,380 sq .ft. per floor. Building will be sprinklered in basement with NFPA 13 system and residential area with a NFPA 13R system. Identical variances have

been granted, 11-07-50, 08-09-35(b), 14-1-37(c) and 12-11-22(g), for student housing. The open lounges are an important feature of modern university student housing design.

AI (b) The code required fire-rated corridor doors will not be self closing or automatic doors as required. Sleeping room doors on floors 1-3 in the addition will not have closers. Similar variances have been granted before.

14-05-39 BI Food Starch Expansion Agglomeratro#2/ Flash Dryer # 4 Additions – Lafavette

Code required 4 hour structurally independent fire wall will not be constructed between existing buildings and the three new additions. In lieu of 4 hour independent fire walls, closed space sprinkler water curtains will be installed. Packing area addition is 11,389 sq. ft. one story building, Type II- B construction. Agglomerator building addition is 40,400 sq. ft. over 4 story building, Type I-B construction. Flash dryer addition is 18,600 sq. ft. over 5 story building Type I-B construction. The additions will be protected with NFPA 13 system. Numerous penetrations of processes piping cause providing a fire wall an undue hardship.

14-05-40 A Ambrose Airtech – Plainfield

Code permitted travel distance to a restroom facility will be exceeded by 533 feet. Distribution warehouse is 403,269 sq. ft. Warehouse employees are ambulatory and typically they will be on forklifts. The hardship is the cost to install more restroom facilities.

14-05-41 CI Love Acres Facility ARC Opportunities – Howe

The code required sprinkler system will not be installed. A new 4,110 sq. ft. assisted living facility Type V-B construction will be provided with a NFPA 13D, 2002 system. Building will be supervised by staff 24 hours a day. What is the cost to comply?

14-05-42 B Project Emerald Ash Office Tower – Fort Wayne

Code required fire rated enclosures will not enclose means of egress stairs connecting floors 7, 8, and 9 in an 18 story building. Building will be protected with a NFPA 13 system. Each floor opening will be protected with an 18" bulkhead and close spaced sprinklers. The proposed stair design will comply with the proposed 2014 International Building Code.

14-05-43 CI Tenneco North Plant West Addition – Ligonier

The code requires either 60' side yards or 4 hour firewalls for an unlimited area building. The request is to use close spaced sprinklers with a maximum of 6' on center for the full length of the north wall in lieu of the 60' side yard or 4 hour fire wall for the wall that is less than 26' from the property line. The addition will be protected with NFPA 13 system. Owner hardship involves cost of \$200,000 for a 4 hour fire wall. What is in this building? What is on the other side of the building?

14-05-44 Project Emerald – Skyline Residential Tower – Fort Wayne

- (a)(b)(c)(d) B (a) The required design pressure for the stair pressurization system of 0.15 w.g. will not be met. The request is to have it designed to 0.05 w.g. Building will be sprinklered throughout with an NFPA13 system. A similar variance, 14-03-15(e), was approved.
 - B (b) Two required Type A units will not be provided in the residential tower. The design will comply with the proposed code change included within LSA Document # 13-339. All units are Type B units. The development will comply with the Federal Fair Housing Act.
 - C (c) Request to use an occupant load of 480 in lieu of the permitted calculated occupant load for a 5th floor roof top terrace between the residential tower and Ash brokerage tower. Two enclosed exit stairs of 2- hour construction discharge directly to grade. Below roof terrace parking garage will be sprinklered per NFPA 13. What is the calculated occupant load? Why are the factors of 7 and 15 not applicable?
 - A (d) The 2012 Energy Conservation Code limits the voltage drop to 2%. The request is to comply with the 2009 Indiana electrical Code and base the calculations on the connected load which is more in line with expected load.
- NVR Tunnel Hill Christian church Storage Building Addition Georgetown

 Storage building addition will not meet the requirements of Table 29.

 Building will be used to store table and chairs, for church functions. Facility meets the 4 conditions of the Commission's non-rule policy document.
- 14-05-46 C **Tabernacle Presbyterian Church Chancel Extension- Indianapolis**The code required accessible route will not be provided for a chancel addition of approximately 150 sq. ft. The chancel is the approximately 18" raised area at the front of the church leading to the alter table. Proponent states that lack of access to chancel is not a violation, of the ADA since the building is a religious facility it is exempt from the ADA.
- 14-05-47 CI **YMCA SWI Camp Carson Cabins Princeton** Project # 368682 and 362912

The code required sprinkler system will not be installed on the front and rear porches. There are two remote exits from each building. NFPA 13R, 2010 in the model text exempts these locations from protection. Fire extinguishers will be provided in each cabin. Variance 13-04-16 granted the deletion of 13R systems from 1 or more cabins, with the condition that a 13D system be installed. Variance 14-02-5 allowed the sprinkler systems to be drained when the buildings were not occupied.

14-05-48 BI **Magnolia Springs Senior Living – Indianapolis** Project #369731

Fire-resistance-rated corridors will not be continuous. 6 rooms will remain open to the exit corridors, and close spaced sprinklers will be installed. The rooms are rated the same as the corridors. The proponent states that openness creates a social interaction of the residents.

14-05-49(a)(b) Westfield High School Community Stadium - Westfield

- (a) Code required number of water closets will not be installed. New stadium CI seating capacity of 5,900 persons will only have approximately 50% of the required water closets. Code requirement is 30 fixtures for males and 59 for women, only 18 men's and 29 women's water closet fixtures will be installed. Proponent states that existing high school can be used if higher demand and portable toilets can be brought in if additional demand is found. Owner's hardship is cost of over \$250,000. to provide a large building and more fixtures. What is the total cost of the project? What is the cost to add more facilities?
- CI (b) New football stadium and press box will not meet the Energy Code. New football stadium and press box will only be used seasonally. Owner's hardship is cost of providing insulation for the exterior walls. What is the cost?

14-05-50 CI The Christmas Goose - Corydon

The General Administrative Rules require that a building be maintained in compliance with the code of record for construction. The request is to allow openings in a wall that is located on the property line, for access to a common, open central stair. The property line is between 2 of 3 interconnected, but separately deeded, buildings. An NFPA 13 system is in 2 of the 3 buildings. The proponent advises that preservation of a downtown historic district is a significant part of the structure.

14-05-51 CI Turbo Crossfit – Indianapolis

Project #368825 Code required 2 hour fire wall will not be installed between existing buildings. The change of occupancy to an A-3 in an existing 24,000 sq. ft. one story building of Type II-B construction causes the building to be over allowable area for construction type. Hardship involves cost of installing 2 hour fire wall. What is the cost of the project? What is the cost to install 2 hour fire wall?

14-05-52 ΑI Heavy's Sports Café Expansion –

The application of Chapter 34 under the current code must be for the entire building. The proponent is requesting that the Chap. 34 evaluation be limited to the tenant space only, instead of the whole building. An existing A-2 occupancy of 4,864 sq. ft. is being expanded by an additional 1,600 sq. ft. No city or county address is provided.